APNIC AGM 2

Thu, Mar 02, 2023 11:29AM • 1:16:10

Gaurab Upadhaya
01:02
We will get started. Okay? Welcome back to the second session of the AGM. In this session, we'll continue with the APNIC Activity Report, the EC Report and then we'll ask our Policy SIG Chairs, and other SIG Chairs, to start presenting their reports from the week. A few standard reminders. This is a hybrid event, we have both on site and remote Zoom participants. So please be conscious of that. If I'm not mistaken, the Zoom link is the same as from the first session… or different one? Okay, so yeah, if you are still there, or… I don't know how to tell people. I should have said that before the end of the last session. I said it's a different Zoom link to go on. And next, I'll actually ask Paul to present our Activity Plan for 2023. So as I said earlier in the day, previously we talked about what happened last year. And then Kenny, in his Treasurer's Report, presented the budget for next year. And now, what are the activities under that budget that happens this year, is what Paul is going to present. Paul?

Paul Wilson
02:42
I think I've got 15 minutes.

Gaurab Upadhaya
02:45
It says…

Paul Wilson
20:47
It's a shorter session, you'll be glad to hear. The Activity Plan. This has been prepared by the Secretariat, approved by the EC as the basis of the budget. There is plenty more detail in the Activity Plan document that gives the full breakdown of activities, costings, the costings in terms of staffing and the operational and capital expenses. So, this is quite a summary. It'll be shorter than the last presentation.

03:26
Starting with the planning process. It's a cycle that begins with the community. And as I mentioned earlier, the APNIC survey is the main way, and a formal way, fully recorded and transparently archived on the on the website, where the APNIC community has got an opportunity to provide input directly to the APNIC EC for considering in the annual and the longer term strategy. So as you see here on the left, the community input comes primarily through the survey but also through other formal and informal channels, into the APNIC Secretariat and into the EC. The planning happens, the execution then is based on that planning, and the reporting comes back to the AGM, the member meeting, through Secretariat reports. Also through some more mechanisms on the website, like the activity tracker, like the product roadmaps, through the blog, through the annual report. You heard the URL before, or the site on the website which

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

is the transparency section, which has got links to all of these reports, the plans, the reports, the surveys, the finances and all of that.

04:46
So at the moment were in the last year of this 2020 to 2023 strategic plan, which was established back then. The current annual plan is '2023' for this year. This year will also be a year of planning for the next four-year plan, and that's going to involve the EC, of course, in several meetings during the course of this year.

05:11
Again, the pillars and workstreams. 18 workstreams stay the same under the five pillars, and the plan is budgeted and described accordingly.

05:23
So a summary of the budget, which Kenny will go into in plenty of detail, is here and we were counting PY – person years – in the first column, which make up 124-and-a-half across five strategic pillars. The distribution of the human resources to those pillars is in the second column. The operational expenditure is divided into what we call operational activities, and investment activities. And the difference between those, which is also described in the planning document, is that operational activities are those which are ongoing and which we regard as the regular required activities to keep the operations of APNIC and the services running. Investment activities, you might describe them as optional, although some of them do involve multi-year investments. But the idea of investment activities is that we're making improvements, we're adding new services, were undertaking new activities, new work that of course we believe is in the interests of, and that has been requested by, members, that has been endorsed by the EC. But the point of making this division is just a show that a significant amount of the expenditure at APNIC is not just to keep the wheels turning, it's to keep improving in response to what seems to be needed.

06:43
The total OPEX, operational expenditure, is there. The capex is a smaller and smaller proportion of our budget actually, as we have been moving progressively from our own hosted hardware to cloud services for many applications. All right, and we also show the OPEX, in this case, by the workstreams, and the totals relative… the relative totals per pillar that you can see, and each pillar divided into those workstreams, making up 18 in total. As I mentioned in the report earlier, the capability workstream is a very large one, it's got a lot of technical infrastructure inside it. And it's also got the more traditional, operational and administrative, you might call, overheads. But this is about developing and maintaining our human resources, the finance and business services, and also the governance of the organization. The second largest pillar there, as you see, is development, followed by membership registry and information.

07:46
So each of these pillars has got a description of its scope and its aims, its objectives, within the strategic plan, and membership is about delivering products and services that are required by the members. And I think you can accept members across most of this report. Unless we're talking about formal membership, membership agreement, membership fees, etc, you can regard members as being fairly

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

inclusive of the of the APNIC community. And many of the membership services do have benefits to the community as well. So we're engaging with members to make sure that we're working together on the APNIC mission, which is towards a global open, stable and secure internet. And we're ensuring accountable provision of those services, governance of those services, to APNIC members, and through APNIC as a membership organization.

08:38
Now, I'm really only providing a summary of the major activities under the workstreams of each pillar. And as I said, more detail is available in the detailed Activity Plan. You'll find in the plan, all of the workstreams individually spelt out with the activities within them. We distinguish between the operational activities and the investment activities under each of the workstreams. You'll find budgetary and human resource summaries for each of the workstreams, all of which should total up into the totals for each of the pillars and the totals for the entire plan. And I hope you find that all of that adds up in the right way. But I'd like to just run through sort of highlights of what we're planning for the next year across the workstreams of the membership pillar.

09:
So we're looking, of course to maintain that SLA, Service Level Agreement, of two business days for all members on member queries. Looking to at least reach or improve on a satisfaction level of 93% 'excellent and about average'. Were looking for actively engaging with members across at least 40 economies of our region – that's the vast majority of economies of our region – to continue that kind of engagement and direct support that we spoke about before. The Member Services Team, as you may know, is divided into sub-regional teams. So we have teams of specialists for each of the sub-regions of the APNIC service region. And, that helps very much to make that active member engagement very meaningful, to serve the needs of different parts of our region. We are continuing user research for products, and of course, members are a major target of that, and particularly membership products. So we're looking to increase the level of engagement there. Membership growth has been a little bit slow in the last few years, but we're projecting and hoping that that is continuing to recover and we'll have a net growth of at least 530 in this year, which is a slight improvement, we hope on 2022. We're looking at further improvements to MyAPNIC. One of the ongoing activities I mentioned was contact management and also improving the functionality of the dashboard with more of those useful widgets and functions that come over from DASH, that allow members who are coming in through MyAPNIC to see more information about, not only their resources, but the relationship of those resources with their networks. And we've got a notification system in place, which is starting to allow members or subscribers or users to subscribe to notifications of events that relate to their network.

11:32
Minimum MyAPNIC Customer Effort Score – that's another measure of the effectiveness of that product of 80%. Improving internal authentication on APIs, for the sake of internal security of those membership systems. We're automating membership closure processes, that's partly driven by the historical resource maintenance, in that, there's been quite a lot of mergers that come about from historical holders who have had multiple records as multiple different organizations, needing a merger and closure. And we have under this pillar also, the membership reporting. So continuing to cover all of our reports and to produce all of our reports in line with the KPIs.

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

12:21
So I don't know why the screen keeps flicking off. But…

Gaurab Upadhaya
12:24
Do we have a problem? No slides and the screen's also gone. Also no slides up there. Okay?

Paul Wilson
12:41
Okay, so we're moving on to the registry pillar. The point of the registry pillar, it's a little similar to membership, but we're looking to deliver world class registry products and services required by the community. The registry pillar is definitely targeted towards all users of the registry. We don't, I think, all of us understand that APNIC members publish data in the registry, but the registry is used by, not only members, but the much wider community and the global community who need to understand the usage of APNIC resources. So, this is also about responsible stewardship, as well as services of the number of resource pools, and delivery of accurate registry services.

13:28
The registry pillar has registration services, registry products and policy development. So we're completing the development this year, at least the first iteration of the registry functions API. So for those of you who like to write code, the idea is that you're able to better integrate APNIC registry functions into your own systems. And I guess we might end up having hackathons around some of these APIs, as the APIs become published and available. That's in Beta Test Mode alongside the NIR API at the moment.

14:03
The authorization mechanisms for WHOIS need to be further updated in line with security expectations. Our registration services team is going through a more systematic way of establishing an assisted registry checklist. A credit to RIPE NCC for this process. It was concept, but it's one of ensuring that according to a checklist of expectations for resource management or registration, we're able to give very clear guidance and assistance to members in how they're using and managing their resources. Oh, we've got new metrics being established for increasing registry accuracy, building on the ICANN work that was done over the last few years.

14:52
NIR, supporting direct ASN assignments to NIR members. Something else I mentioned this morning and which is ongoing, is the validation of RPKI changes against the routing table to make sure they're accurate and they don't introduce problems that create inconsistencies with the routing state. Creating and validating RSC objects in MyAPNIC. Improving ASN delegation processes across WHOIS and MyAPNIC. We're continuing some serious consultations on the need and the expectations, the applicability, of a five-9s goal for highly critical services. And we're aiming to meet, as we have done, 100% of policy implementation timelines, SLAs, that have been established. Under the development pillar. This pillar is about investing in the sustainable development of the regional internet community, also the industry and the infrastructure, building capacity for best practice internet operations across the entire technical

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

community of the region. Now, I guess this might sound a bit like APNIC is trying to do all of this on its own. That's not the case. The whole point of this development program is very much partnership cooperation, support, capacity building and working with communities regionally and at the national and the NOG levels to achieve these aims.

16:25
The development pillar has got these six workstreams: conferences, foundation, community engagement, and participation, the APNIC Academy, and supporting infrastructure. So we're looking for 1200 attendees at conferences this year, with a net promoter score of at least 50, which we've achieved well and truly in the past. We're looking to at least 22-plus community events and 15-plus security events, and to continue supporting the new and emerging CERTs of the region. The IGF, the national and regional initiatives, in our region, we feel we need to go on supporting the Internet Governance Forum, particularly in understanding and having that community – very diverse community – understand better how the IP address management system works, how APNIC amongst the other RIRs work, how the multistakeholder governance system works, and there's a continual demand for that. In fact, after the sort of down period of COVID, we find that there's a lot of education and awareness building that's needed, as many – particularly in government's – as many government officials tend to roll over and be replaced on a multi-year basis. So there's a lot of work, a lot of catch-up work to be done there actually.

17:56
So again, looking for a number of capacity building activities, trainings and related, with government agencies. We're looking to increase APNIC engagements and maintain at least 300 engagements. This is where the staff of APNIC Secretariat and the other representatives, like community trainers, are going out from APNIC and engaging with the community. The word we use, for the opposite of 'more of the community coming into events and activities organized by APNIC', is what we refer to as 'community participation'.

18:35
Orbit, the new mailing list platform. We're looking to bring on at least 650 new users there, and an increase in the number of posts, the amount of activity on the platform. We're looking for a fellowship program to maintain that very high net promoter score.

18:55
I hope we can fix this display during the lunchtime.

19:01
We're looking for increasing the net promoter score or maintaining a net promoter score of the fellowship program, maintaining at least the same level of online Academy course and lab use. We'd like to reach 30,000 registered users on the Academy. We'd like to create at least, or present, at least 80 different instructor-led tutorials and workshops, achieve 10 retained community trainer positions. These are trainers who are committed and receive compensation from APNIC, to be committed, to be available to training and other supporting activities around the development and maintenance of APNIC Academy content. We're looking for training of at least eight sessions in RPKI, IPv6 and at least six in IXP support. We're looking for a 90%-plus ROA coverage in at least four additional economies in this current year,

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

looking to continue to support peering forums and APIX, establish a training certification program for the Academy, which will provide a more formalized and structured certification for the students of the Academy. And as I mentioned, to complete the deployment of those 12 M-root anycast instances, which are sort of waiting in the queue at the moment, since last year,

20:32
The information pillar is about supporting internet development with the needed network information services, the research outcomes, which are of demonstrated value to the community.

20:45
And under this pillar, we'd like to increase the amount of blog usage and podcast usage that we see. We're, as I mentioned, providing alerts on a notification service that allows subscribers to receive information about events on their networks, and we're hoping to be deploying that to at least 120 additional subscribers. Adding more DASH widgets to the MyAPNIC dashboard to continue that integration. Expanding REx, the resource explorer, to cover globally, the delegations of RPKI and DNSSEC stats. The APNIC dotnet website will be structured and have a content refresh during the year. We've got cooperative research projects which will continue with those three organizations, as mentioned before. And hoping to maintain a high rate of publication of articles, reports, presentations and podcasts through the year.

21:55
Finally, on pillar five, capability. This is all about the secure and stable internet infrastructure that supports both internal and public APNIC operations and services. We want to also make sure that APNIC, as an organization, has got a very strong service culture driven by people who are committed to APNIC's vision and values, and to sustain a healthy, resilient organizational structure.

22:23
So we are, on that more technical side, we are looking to, of course, maintain the four-9s' availability for critical and non-critical services, and 99.95 for the non-critical services. Maintaining our 24/7 incident response team, providing what we need to do in preparation for possible five-9s – and it's a good initiative in any case, is to increase the current precision of our real-time availability monitoring, to support five-9s. We need to pass our first ISO27001 audit after our initial certification this year. We're migrating all staff to a to a zero-trust network access framework. Introducing internal code vulnerability scanning as well, that complements the penetration testing and so forth – that's also going on.

23:19
On the more financial and administrative side, we've got the regular APNIC audit that happens every year. You probably know that we undertake that full financial audit voluntarily, every year, in order to make sure that there's absolutely no doubt about the correct financial operations of APNIC as an organization. That's something that is generally passed without any exceptions whatsoever, and we need to maintain that. We're maintaining business continuity and disaster recovery planning, scenario planning, passing our ISO9001 audit. As I mentioned, the ISO9001 was extended last year to include product development. And so, the continuing maintenance of that [unclear] system is pretty important.

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

24:10
We've got global benchmarks for human resources, in staff engagement, in diversity, and culture, to be maintained. We've got to maintain benchmarks for staff turnover. And working, wotking [*sic*], with the EC to develop the 2024-2027 strategic plan. And that's something that you'll certainly be hearing about through the course of this year and into the next meeting, in the next conference in September.

24:44
There are a number of Foundation-funded activities provided here along with… So that you get a sense of the size of these activities within the staffing and budget, we've got eight Foundation-funded projects or activity areas, within APNIC that add up to 16.55 of the APNIC staff, funded by the Foundation and $4.4 million AUD. And that's in Academy product development in expanding training events and the community trainers network, the… repetition of Academy product development there – probably a typo. Curriculum for non-technical audiences, their Honeynet, M-Root deployment and some additional contribution to research and measurements that's funded by the Foundation.

25:34
And that's it for the Activity Plan. Now, I know that's very much a sort of a whistlestop tour of the plan, that's giving you a taste of the breadth and number of activities that are being planned. But if you would like to know more, then please, by all means, ask. Also, there's many more details available in the documentation that's posted on the website. And that's posted on the website already, I believe. Right, Tony? Tony nods yes. Okay? Thanks very much again for your attention. And I'll hand back to the Chair. Thank you.

Gaurab Upadhaya
26:08
Thank you, Paul. As Paul said, the Activity Plan and the corresponding allocation of resourcing, budget, is all on the website now. So I encourage you to go and take a look at that so that we have a better idea of it. And I think the next speaker is me.

26:36
Okay, so I'll probably just present from here.

26:39
So next is the APNIC EC Report, which I will present as the EC Chair. We ran through the introductions this morning, we have eight EC members, seven of us are elected. And Paul, as the DG, is the Ex-officio member of the Board. So given that we did the introductions this morning, you can play the 'Compare the photo with the faces on the stage' game, but that's about it at this point.

27:19
The functions of the APNIC EC are pretty well-defined by our bylaws. We represent the interests of the members in the governance of APNIC. We have oversight over the APNIC's activities. Apart from looking at the address policy and taking them to implementation, we also consider broader policy issues in the region or in the world for APNIC strategic direction. We set fees for our members.

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

27:51
EC meetings. We generally meet four times a year, and that has been the case for many, many years now. We've had five meetings since the last AGM or the APNIC 53 AGM, which was a virtual meeting. During the pandemic, we were a bit more flexible in how we met, because when we have on site meetings, we had to meet during the meeting or… there's not a lot of choice. But during the pandemic, we've been a bit more flexible and met the week before or the week after the actual conference. The next meeting will be one at the end of the day today, with the newly elected EC members. And then the one after that, is set for Brisbane at the APNIC offices in May. And the meeting is in the office mainly because it is also a strategic planning exercise for the next four years. And in that meeting, there'll be a lot of participation from the staff as well.

29:00
Other meetings. We generally meet with the Foundation Board. We had one earlier this week. Same thing, APNOG, APRICOT, is a key partner for APNIC. So we meet with the APNIC Board. That also happened earlier this week. And then, something that we started during the pandemic or the first year of the pandemic, was we started having a meeting of all the volunteers that get elected to different roles. You know, it's not just the EC that gets elected. There are other roles, like the ROO EC, SIG Chairs, APIX, APNOG Board, and collectively, we were missing the hallway conversation during the pandemic. So that is a way of getting a broader set of people to talk to each other, so that we can find the pulse of what was going on in their own community, because the EC, we only have seven of us. The elected leaders come from all over the region, and that helped us get a broader perspective on how we continue doing events, how we continue to meet, and so on. And we also had a meeting of the elected leaders earlier this week. All of our meeting minutes are recorded, so everything is on the link that is on the screen there, apnic.net/ec.

30:36
There has been perfect attendance, no late notice or anything, tardy notes.

30:47
I talked about the survey earlier this morning. We conducted the survey last year. The surveys are conducted by an independent company. And I don't know most for those who submit the survey. The survey is not just limited to members, but to stakeholders in the region and worldwide. And it gets input from the community for APNIC's performance, priorities, and future activities. Again, thank you everyone for your participation, those who are here and those who are online and those who will watch the streams later on. We had 65% of our members respond. Survey results and the EC response to it are already published. You can go to survey.apnic.net to find really detailed output from the survey, and how we responded to it. The last year survey was important also, because it will guide the next four years' strategic planning, which will happen in May and throughout the year.

32:02
Policy wise, we are familiar with this. The APNIC Public Policy SIG or SIG Policy, reached consensus on three different policy proposals in 2022. And we have endorsed and resolved that it goes to implementation. I won't read all of those, but thank you everyone who worked hard in the policy process.

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

32:32

Finances. We had a big report from the Treasurer earlier so I won't go into details at the high level. Membership growth is below budget assumptions. I guess, you know, we had a bit of an increase during the early years of COVID but it seems to have stabilized. But we also don't know why these things swing in different phases. So we just go by what we see. We had an operating deficit of AUD $300,000. And then, as the market has gone up and down, we've seen a downward trend and our portfolio size, the investment portfolio, reduced by $4 million. We've approved 2022 audited financial statements. And we have approved the activity planning and budget for 2023, which were already presented here. And then we have… you know, APNIC has an interesting status in Australia, where we are recognized as a mutual organization and we have to maintain that to avoid paying large sums of money as tax. And that was confirmed by the Australian Tax Office, and it will be valid, the current confirmation will be valid till June 2027. This has become more procedural in the recent times. We haven't seen any reason to, you know, or any queries from the Australian Tax Office on this topic, unlike a couple of years ago where there was a lot of queries. But it seems to be that the ATO is happy with our governance, with our reporting, with our audits, and so this is a procedural matter at this point.

34:24

Fees. One of the responsibilities of the EC is to set fees for the membership and APNIC services. We announced a schedule change in December 2022. It was raising fees because of really high inflation and the cost of operations going up. We had not changed any fees since 2020. In 2020, we had made us very small change. So this time, we changed the bit factor, instead of sending the fee to certain members of something, or any other decisions. Interestingly, we went from 1.3 to 1.31. And again, those of you who have been around long enough, remember that we originally had 1.31. And when we had a good economic situation and the operating costs went down, we had reduced it from 1.31 to 1.30. So we went back to the 1.31 bit factor, for the members at least. This approach basically creates less burden on the smaller members, rather than changing the base fees, which will be applicable across everyone. This creates a good balance. And we also thought that, changing the bit factor like we did almost 10 years ago, was the right approach because the inflation pressures are very different across every country in the Asia Pacific region, so they're not uniform. We continue to monitor the economic environment. As I said, you know, inflation numbers these last years have been really high in some countries. Other countries seems to have it more stable, but the general trend is still looking at high inflation, which means the costs for everyone continues to increase. And you know, we're conscious of that, and we're looking at different ways to minimize the impact, like setting up installed payment… by installations, sorry, instalments, and a few other options we could look for. And this is a topic of priority for us.

36:41

The NRO NC / ASO AC, Number Resource Organized and Numbering Council, and Address Supporting Organization and Advisory Council – they are the same thing, different names. In the RIR context, we call them NRO NC; in the ICANN context, they are called ASO AC. The APNIC EC reappointed Nicole Chan to the Number Council for a one-year term, from the beginning of this year till the end of this year. Thank you to Nicole, she has been serving and she's been elected as the Vice-Chair of the NRO NC / ASO AC. We have three representatives on the NRO NC / ASO AC. We have Di Ma and Gaurav Kansal, both elected by the community, and Nicole Chan who was appointed by the EC. We thank all the current

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

members and also thank the outgoing member, Shubham Saran, from India. Thank you very much for your service, all of you.

37:43
And then there is IANA RC. This is the review committee for PTI, which manages a number of resources under ICANN. We appointed Dibya Khatiwada to the IANA Review Committee for a two-year term from the beginning of this year till the end of next year. We have three representatives: Ching-Heng Ku, elected by the community; Dibya Khatiwada, appointed by the EC; and Guangliang Pan, as the APNIC staff. This structure is sort of agreed, when we did [unclear] transition many years ago. So we thank all the members who contribute to it, and even expect to see the report from the IANA RC published when it is available. All the other RIRs also nominate and I believe the report is due very soon, or the publication of the report is due very soon.

38:45
APNIC Conferences. We're obviously in APNIC 55. Thank you very much everyone who's here. The next APNIC meeting will be in Kyoto, Japan. Long ago before the pandemic, we thought we're going to Sapporo. But when we started to resume on-site preparations, our Japanese hosts told us that the Sapporo facilities are not available anymore. So we've gone back to Kyoto, where we had APRICOT in 2005, I believe. It's the same venue where the Kyoto Protocol was signed, if you are so inclined to know more about it.

39:33
The APNIC EC has decided that September 2024, APNIC 58 will be held in New Zealand, because it's the turn for us to go to the Pacific. APNOG and APRICOT will announce the 2024 host very soon. They're still working through their preparations, and APNIC 57 venue will be known when APRICOT APNOG makes their decision and publicizes that.

40:08
Member feedback. As usual, there are multiple ways to provide feedback to the EC via APNIC's 'Contact us' form, here during the conference, and through the website as well.

40:25
That was the photo taken earlier this week. And thank you very much to all the members and all the participants and all the stakeholders who are here, including Board members from other RIRs, and staff from internet organizations across the region and the world. Thank you very much for your support.

40:57
Okay, I got some feedback here. Okay, I got a message. So we have a couple of agenda items here. But before that, we are going to have open mic questions about the Activity Plan or the EC Report. Anyone there?

41:34
Okay, if not, before I go to request Bertrand to get started, to get prepared for the Policy SIG Report, I have just been informed that if anyone encounters any issues with accessing the voting platform, we

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

have APNIC staff here, we can help. They can contact the helpdesk, which is outside on the left of this room, or email the helpdesk at helpdesk@apnic.net, or contact via phone on an Australian number +61738583188. If you didn't get that number, you can come and ask me later here. But I recommend that you go outside and talk to folks on the service desk. And those who are remote, should be able to get the email address and the Zoom administrators can publish this contact information onto the Zoom chatrooms, please, and that will allow the remote participants to get the same information.

42:46
And we also believe that all the issues that have been raised by members so far, have been resolved at this point. Thank you very much. Now I'm going to ask Bertrand – he's somewhere – to come up to the mic and do the Policy SIG Report.

Bertrand Cherrier
43:22
Good morning, everyone. Bertrand Cherrier from New Caledonia doing the Policy SIG Report.

43:36
The Policy SIG Charter is to develop policies which relate to the management and use of internet number resources within the Asia Pacific regions. These include policies for resource allocation, recovery, transfer, and resource registration within WHOIS, reverse DNS RPKI and related services.

43:57
We had four proposals to deal with this time. Prop-147: Historical Resource Management. This proposal suggests that custodians can claim historical resources that have been marked as reserved within 12 months of the date they were marked as reserved. After 12 months, these resources will be placed in the free pool for re-delegation. This proposal did reach consensus at the OPM, and I will now call for consensus and this member meeting. Will you do it?

44:40
Okay. So the EC Chair will organize this.

Gaurab Upadhaya
44:43
Yeah, this is Gaurab Upadhaya. We do it in different ways every time. We can call for consensus right now or do it at the end. Let's do it right now. Yeah. We'll do it.

Bertrand Cherrier
44:56
No, we'll just wait for the… Yep. Now, okay. After each…

Gaurab Upadhaya
45:02
After each of these to save some time.

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

45:06
So we are ready to call for consensus on this particular policy proposal. It reached consensus in the Policy SIG. So all of those who agree with this, please just raise your hands. And I think we have the online thing also available now.

45:26
Looks good. And I'm going to go straight to the other extreme. Anybody very strongly opposed to it? Be aware that if you're strongly opposed to it, you should come up to the mic and present your views on it. Anyone strongly opposed to this?

45:41
Anyone opposed to it?

45:45
Looks like we have a fairly good amount of consensus on this particular policy proposal. So I would say this has reached consensus, or, you know, we agreed with the consensus reached in the Policy SIG. Thank you very much. Let's go to the next one.

Bertrand Cherrier

46:08
Prop-149: Change of maximum delegation for less than /21 total IPv4 holdings. This proposals suggests increasing the maximum IPv4 delegation size for new APNIC account holders from a /23 to a /22. And if requested, delegating an additional /23 for APNIC account holders with less than a total of a /21 of IPv4 resources. APNIC account holders with a total amount of IPv4 resources equal to and more than a /21 are not eligible. This proposal was sent back to the mailing list.

46:55
Prop-150: ROA/WHOIS object with private, reserved, and unallocated Origin ASN. This proposal suggests APNIC restrict and account holder's right to create ROAs with private, reserved, or unallocated ASN.s This proposal also suggests APNIC notify account holders if the Origin ASN in their ROA is unallocated, and to not automatically renew ROAs with unallocated ASNs. This proposal reached consensus at the OPM.

Gaurab Upadhaya

47:32
Thank you, Bertrand. Again, we'll go through the same routine. Anyone who is or other folks who are in favor of this proposal, please raise your hands.

47:50
Looks good. Those who are strongly opposed to this particular proposal?

47:58
Anyone opposed to the proposal in any minor form or format?

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

48:05
Okay, I think we can say that we agree to the consensus reached in the Policy SIG two days ago. We can go on.

Bertrand Cherrier
48:20
Prop-151: Restricting non-hierarchical as-set. This proposal would restrict APNIC account holders from creating a non-hierarchical as-set, and notify all members who already have a non-hierarchical as-set, that it is recommended they move to a hierarchical as-set. And this proposal did reach consensus at the OPM.

Gaurab Upadhaya
48:49
Thank you, same process. Anyone – I'll do it the other way around this time – anyone strongly opposed to it?

48:58
Anyone opposed to this?

49:01
Those who are in favor of this policy going forward?

49:08
Looks good to me.

49:11
We can say that we've agreed or concurred with the consensus reached in the Open Policy Meeting. Thank you.

Bertrand Cherrier
49:22
We had a presentation to propose changes to the policy development process. It's mainly to define the deadline and remove any confusion in the PDP. This presentation received support from the SIG and very good comments. It will be a proposal for the next OPM in Kyoto.

49:46
We had a panel discussion: Leasing IP addresses. It was to define the will of the community about leasing of IP addresses, following the opposition to the Prop-148 at APNIC 54. This discussion might lead to a new proposal as leasing is NOT allowed, but in use.

50:09
Outcome and actions: The Prop-149 that was presented at the OPM, was not the proposal published on the mailing list. So no consensus call was made, and the proposal was sent back to the mailing list.

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

50:27
And that's it for me. Any comments or questions?

Gaurab Upadhaya
50:34
Any comments or questions, click once. None? We still have in the end, there is another open mic, we can bring that up then. Thank you very much for the Policy SIG Chairs for doing this, and all the policy authors and those who participated in the policy process. I will not let Bertrand go away from here, but he is going to present a second report, which is the Joint SIG Meeting.

Bertrand Cherrier
51:07
So this Joint SIG Meeting Report was to update the election procedures in the SIG Guidelines.

51:19
During the community elections held at APNIC 54, anomalies were observed in the conference registration list and in the patterns of online participation. The implications are significant. SIG elections normally attract 50 to 100 votes. Therefore an organized voting bloc of 250 more would determine election results in the future.

51:47
So we need to ensure the integrity of APNIC SIG elections.

51:54
We proposed that elections will use the same online voting system as APNIC EC and NRO NC elections. Individuals cannot hold more than one elected position. Those who are elected to a new position must resign from any other currently held position as soon as practicable, but no later than 30 days following the election. Each APNIC member is entitled to cast one vote during the time noted in the SIG election timetable. There is no proxy voting at SIG elections. APNIC staff and other RIR staff are ineligible to vote.

52:32
Online voting for APNIC members and eligible registered conference attendees will open two hours after the start of the APNIC Conference, and will close at the end of the lunch break on the last day of the APNIC Conference, just before the start of the AMM. If a SIG Chair or Co-Chair does not attend one in every two APNIC Conferences and does not attend the SIG Forum held at the APNIC Conference, the APNIC EC will have discretion to remove the Chair or Co-Chair from their role. The process of electing a replacement will then begin.

53:07
Pros and cons. It allows verification of conference attendees as real people who are eligible to vote. It ensure individuals cannot hold multiple community-elected positions to avoid ‘capture’ of community roles. And it clarifies who is responsible for the removal of a Chair or Co-Chair. The disadvantage is that online-only conference participants who are not members are ineligible to vote.

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

53:41
These modifications were well received by the community and we reached a consensus. It will be published shortly after this conference. And that's it for my report. Thanks.

Gaurab Upadhaya
53:59
Thank you, Bertrand and Joy for leading this process. I know it's been a pretty intensive last couple of months, getting this to a level where all the SIG Chairs have agreed and make the recommendations. And updating our SIG guidelines is a pretty ongoing process. We keep adapting. And I think before the pandemic or on the run-up to the pandemic, we kind of had to adapt because obviously, all of our SIG selections were a show of hands. And when we had the pandemic, we couldn't really do that. And then we basically said “Everybody online could do it”. And then we realized that, you know, we didn't think enough about it. So, I guess this new set of guidelines will continue to be adapted, as we experience more with our elections. So thank you very much Joy and Bertrand, and thank you also to all the SIG Chairs and other members of the community. Actually, I should mention the elected leaders community, because all of them participated in this process, including those at the APIX and APNOG Boards, who are not just SIG Chairs. So thank you everyone for this, and thank you to the two Chairs of the Joint SIG Meetings to have delivered this for the membership.

55:34
Okay, so now I go on to the next SIG report, which is Routing Security SIG, and our Chair, Di Ma, is going to present this.

Di Ma
55:54
Good morning, everyone. Good morning, everyone. I'm Di Ma, the Acting Chair or Routing Security SIG Chair of APNIC. And I'm glad to be here to review our SIG forum during this APNIC meeting.

56:14
Above all, our SIG is a place where you can find out what is going on with routing security, in terms of new technology, your standards, solutions, and as well as current practices. And discussions in this forum and the mailing list, could be then utilized to advise the APNIC community in preparing technical elements of policy proposals concerning routing security.

56:46
And there were four presentations here in the SIG forum. Aftab, from ISOC, provided insights into IRR database issues and encouraged network operators to use hierarchical as-sets. Yanbiao Li, a professor from Chinese Academy of Sciences, shared observations on the issues of the operational granularity of RPKI ROAs and presented a novel scheme to encode ROAs with bitmaps for flexible and fine-grained management. Fang Gao, a lady, discussed the IP spoofing situation on the internet and corresponding technologies to prevent spoofing attacks on the network layer, including existing and emerging source address validation mechanisms. And Tom Harrison from APNIC made a brief introduction to RPKI signed checklists and its use cases. As far as I observe, the RPKI signed checklists is really promising, but requires more use cases to help people to understand how they can benefit from it. And once again, I

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

believe the academic and research community should be strongly encouraged to come and share what they have done with their network operations.

58:14
Moving on to outcomes and actions. Aftab made a policy proposal of restricting non-hierarchical as-sets, as discussed in our SIG forum. So I guess that's all about my report. Thank you.

Gaurab Upadhaya
58:34
Thank you, Di Ma. Thank you very much. Yeah, the routing security SIG has made a lot of interesting discussions. One of the things you did not mention, but we talked about it, was that there is going to be a policy proposal coming from the Routing SIG in the next OPM. Thank you very much.

59:01
I will – I know we are ahead of the time – so I'm going to request our NIR SIG Chair, I think I see her there, to comment just to the report. And do I see Joy Chan somewhere in the room? Okay, I don't see Joy, so let me see who is after Joy.

59:28
Yeah, we can do the…

Oanh Nguyen
59:39
Good morning, everyone. I'm Oanh from the NIR SIG Chair. I would like to report about the NIR SIG Chair in this meeting. Yeah.

59:51
The Charter of the NIR SIG is to share information relating to the operations, policies and procedures of the National Internet Registries with the aim of promoting close cooperation both among the NIRs and also with the APNIC.

1:00:10
And yeah, so seven presentations at NIR SIG's forum. The first was from IRINN. We've got some key points to increase the IP members in India. And also, they have nine training courses and with a great number of IPv6 deployment, 75%. And also, they have a great ROA RPKI for IPv4 and IPv6. And from JPNIC, they also too have got a great number of RPKI – more than 74%, IPv6 and IPv4 ready for ROA. And also, they have many technical events and supporting JANOG, yeah. Also, the OPM in JPNIC had a hot topic – IP address lease problems. And also from TWNIC, they have a deployed IPv6 very, very well from 2017. And up to now, they have a [unclear] number nearly 50% IPv6. And also in OPM, the [unclear] topic is IPv6 security. And also, there is a great number of RPKI deployment in Taiwan. From IDNIC, they also have achieved a great number of IP members, to increase 30%, yeah. And also they have eight courses for training for RPKI and IPv6, as well. And also some technical new service to their members. And ROA is also the key part from IDNIC with 75% ROA and they look forward to have more than 90% ROA in this year.

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

1:02:08
From CNNIC [unclear] they keep supporting the community with three training courses. And also the IPv6 in China, it keep… yeah, have a great policy and also do network activity to get a great number, especially for major websites, for government and media. Maybe 98 ready IPv6. And from VNNIC, they also have a great activity focused on the VNNIC internet conference, and also sharing some information on IPv6 deployment in Vietnam. And also now, Vietnam has more than 53% IPv6 deployment, and also a great number from mobile and network. From another presentation from NIR SIG Chairs, we saw the functions, fee policy, WHOIS, RPKI, IPv6 deployment, and some information relating to IPS number among NIRs.

1:03:21
Yes, it's great that we have got seven presentations, from six NIRs and one from SIG Chairs. As the main content of this forum, it focused on IPv6 and RPKI. And the main activities among NIRs, focused on OPM, and also training and supporting NIR's community. And also, some NIRs making plans for new targets in this year, basically focused on RPKI and IPv6. And that's my report. Thank you.

Gaurab Upadhaya
1:04:02
Thank you so much. Any questions there or any comments on the two SIG presentations? We can have any questions about the Routing SIG or the NIR SIG.

1:04:17
Right, Aftab, I see the usual suspect.

Aftab Siddiqui
1:04:24
Thank you sir. Aftab Siddiqui. I have one request to Oanh. What we have seen in the past so many years, is that the JPNIC community is specifically – and at times, the TWNIC community – they do their own policy SIG discussion on the topic of policies, which will be discussed in the next policy meeting. And they provide really, really valuable feedback. Because at times, I do understand that there are language barriers. I'm not a native English speaker myself, so I do understand this problem. So if every NIR can do something similar, so we can bridge this gap of the language at least with people who are having difficulties with that, I would really like to see more commitment. I know it's an extra effort. But as someone who has proposed multiple policies in the past, if I can be of any help, I'm pretty sure other authors will be able to help to make it easy for the NIRs. If something can be done, we would like to see more participation coming from the NIR side.

Oanh Nguyen
1:05:34
Okay, thank you Aftab. And I think we look forward to many activities among NIRs and also to get involved not only NIRs, but also in our community, to come to APNIC meetings and also to make it better in [unclear] NIRs. And Akinori-san?

Akinori Maemura

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

1:05:52
Thank you very much. Akinori Maemura from JPNIC. Thank you very much, Aftab, for the remarks for the Japanese community. I'd like to introduce some of the what kind of activity is being done in the Japanese community. Actually, we have the JPNIC Open Policy forum to discuss the other policies in Japan. Now, that is not administered by JPNIC, but it is a voluntary team. The first name is the JP Open Policy Forum Steering Team. Now they are quite a community-based activity. So in the JPNIC area, the policy discussion is left to the community fully. And then we sometimes do offer some support, but that's all. Then I sometimes refer to it as the 'extreme bottom-up process' in Japan. So that's how we do the policy discussion in Japan. Then, that discussion is summarized by the JP OPF Steering Team, and then provided to the APNIC community. So thank you very much, Aftab, for the referral. And then I'm very happy to have this kind of introduction to the APNIC community. Thank you very much.

Gaurab Upadhaya
1:07:15
Thank you, Akinori-san and Aftab, for this interesting conversation. Something that, you know, I observed also with the JP community was, even at JANOG there is an entire session dedicated to policy. And that seems to create a lot more excitement amongst the operators and engineers. So maybe the other NOGs could take a leaf from that and see what could be done and contribute back to the community here.

Oanh Nguyen
1:07:53
Okay.

Gaurab Upadhaya
1:07:54
Thank you very much. Is there any other commentary or not? Because otherwise, we will break 20 minutes early for lunch? Any comments, questions? Anything? I mean, this is open mic. There could be comments on anything. You know, we have some time here.

Karl Kloppenborg
1:08:19
Well, in that case. *(laughs)* So Karl Kloppenborg from Australia. And I've been a bit of a broken record on this subject but we've got only minutes/maybe an hour to spare before the voting closes, and I want to make a couple of comments. First of all, a lot of people in the past have criticized APNIC on their transparency. But I wanted to just say thank you for the activity statements that happened before. They were a really thorough indication and understanding of what APNIC's 2023 plans are. But the other thing that I wanted to bring up is that, you know, there's a lot of people in this room right now. And if we have a look around, at no point has there been a number of the – and I'm not going to say names again – but a number of the EC nominees have been not present in any of the special interest groups, or more importantly this AGM. And I find it incredibly telling that people want to put themselves up onto the Council, but yet have no interest whatsoever in the actual procedures. And so, have a look around the room, see if you notice anyone that's missing. And yeah, have a think about that.

Gaurab Upadhaya

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

1:09:44
Thank you, Karl, noted. Siena? Remote.

Siena
1:09:52
So this is a comment from Narelle Clark remotely. She says “I'd like to thank the EC and other SIG working groups for their professional and capable work”.

Gaurab Upadhaya
1:10:02
Thank you. Any other comments there?

Jonathan Brewer
1:10:20
Jonathan Brewer, in New Zealand. I appreciate all the transparency that I've seen. I appreciate the hard work of the EC.

Gaurab Upadhaya
1:10:29
Jon, I think you’ll need to pull the mic up a little bit.

Jonathan Brewer
1:10:32
I said nice things about you. I said nice things about the EC. And I think if people believe that the direction is wrong, that maybe the appointment of independent directors would be a good idea.

Gaurab Upadhaya
1:10:47
Thank you. Thank you, Jon and Karl, and everyone else on this topic, I think we should take note of all of this, as we look at, you know, whatever improvements. It’s a continuous process to improve and make ourselves accountable to the community. Right? So it's an ongoing process, all noted. So before we break for lunch, I will remind everyone that… is that someone going to the mic?

Rupesh Shrestha
1:11:18
Rupesh from NPIX. I have a quick request. I just noticed that the annual report, it's published just a while ago. Would it be possible to publish annual report a day or two earlier for the previous year, so that we can just have a look and then be prepared and see what kind of… when the planning is presented, then we can have a better idea in terms of like what has happened and what's planned for, and then make a comment based on that? And just I was just going through the annual report for 2022 and it looks like one zero is missing in the total for the capability part. So probably that might need to be corrected. Thank you.

Gaurab Upadhaya

Transcribed by https://otter.ai

1:11:58
Thank you [unclear]. We should hire you as a copy editor, I guess. But yeah, I just saw Tony nodding as to publishing the annual report in advance, and we should do that. I think it's just been a practice that the annual report is traditionally published at the start of the days here. But we don't need to hold onto that practice, we easily can publish at the beginning of the week, when APNIC 55, our APNIC meeting kicks off. The February ones are tight, because we don't get all the reporting and all the edits done before pretty much early February. So it becomes a scramble to put together. But yeah, I think that was noted. And typos, Tony's, good luck. The good thing is we don't print them anymore, so we can update it *(laughs)* quickly.

1:12:58
So I need to remind everyone that APNIC election voting is still going on. It stops at… what time Sunny? 2:30. So we'll stop the voting system and close at 2:30 so you have roughly another hour-and-a-half, almost two hours. So if not… local time, Manila time. Yes, 2:30 Manila time. Please vote while the system is still open. If you are having trouble, then please contact the helpdesk outside. And for the remote attendees, you've got the contact address, the phone number to call if you're having trouble with the system. So still a reminder to vote.

1:13:47
And we are going to break for lunch now and be back here at 2:30. So we'll start exactly at 2:30 and that's when the voting will also stop. Thank you very much. Off to lunch, and lunch is at the usual location down the stairs in the tent outside. Thank you.

END OF TRANSCRIPT.

Transcribed by https://otter.ai